EXHIBIT 4

	Case 4:10-cv-00052-RAW Docume	nt 1 1	16-4 Filed 05/13/15 Page 3 of 5
1	APPEARANCES	" -	4
		1	JARED TAGLIALATELA, Ph.D.,
2	Plaintiffs by:	2	called as a witness, having been first duly
3	WILLIAM J. MILLER	3	sworn, testified as follows:
4	BRIAN A. MELHUS Attorneys at Law	4	DIRECT EXAMINATION
_	DORSEÝ & WHITNEY, LLP	5	BY MR. ZIFCHAK:
5	801 Grand Avenue Suite 4100	6	Q. Morning, Jared.
6	Des Moines, IA 50309	7	
7	(515) 283-1000 m iller.w illiam @ dorsey.com	-	A. Morning.
8	m elhus.brian @ dorsey.com	8	Q. Would you please state your name and
0	Defendant Sue Savage-Rumbaugh, Ph.D., and	9	business address for the record?
9	Intervenor Defendant Bonobo Hope Initiative,	10	A. Jared Taglialatela. My business
10	Inc., by: WILLIAM ZIFCHAK	11	address I have a couple of them, but my home
11	Attorney at Law	12	institution is Kennesaw State University. It's
''	KAYE SCHOLER, LLP 250 West 55th Street	13	1000 Chastain Road, Kennesaw, Georgia 30144.
12	New York, NY 10019	14	Q. Just a few preliminaries. Have you
13	(212) 836-8000 william .zifchak@ kayescholer.com	15	ever been deposed before, given testimony in a
14	ROSS H. NEIHAUS	16	legal action?
	Attorney at Law	17	A. No.
15	KAYE SCHOLER, LLP 70 West Madison Street	18	
16	Suite 4200	19	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
17	Chicago, IL 60602 (312) 583-2300		understand, please say so, and I'll try to
	ross.neihaus@ kayescholer.com	20	explain it or rephrase it.
18	Also present: SUE SAVAGE-RUMBAUGH, Ph.D.	21	A. Okay.
19	Also present. Soe SAVAGE ROMBAGGII, FILD.	22	Q. Your counsel may state objections to
20 21		23	certain of my questions, principally if they are
22		24	stated ineloquently, but unless he directs you
23 24		25	not to answer, you should answer the question.
25			HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.
	HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD. (515) 288-4910		(515) 288-4910
	3		5
1		1	
1 2	INDEX	1 2	A. Um-hum.
2	INDEX Examination by: Page	2	A. Um-hum.Q. Are you taking any medication or
2	INDEX	2	A. Um-hum.Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to
2 3 4	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today?
2 3 4 5	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked	2 3 4 5	 A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No.
2 3 4 5 6	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95	2 3 4 5 6	 A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary
2 3 4 5	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked	2 3 4 5	 A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No.
2 3 4 5 6	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95	2 3 4 5 6	 A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary
2 3 4 5 6 7	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95	2 3 4 5 6 7	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95 3 95	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95 3 95 4 114	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95 3 95 4 114 5 160	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95 3 95 4 114 5 160 6 165	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95 3 95 4 114 5 160 6 165 7 174	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	INDEX Examination by: Page Page	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4 Exhibit Marked 1 95 2 95 3 95 4 114 5 160 6 165 7 174 Request by: Page:Line Mr. Zifchak 10:15	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a Ph.D. in neurobiology and behavior from Georgia
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a Ph.D. in neurobiology and behavior from Georgia
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a Ph.D. in neurobiology and behavior from Georgia State University. It was awarded in 2004. I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a Ph.D. in neurobiology and behavior from Georgia State University. It was awarded in 2004. I have an NIH postdoctoral fellowship that was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a Ph.D. in neurobiology and behavior from Georgia State University. It was awarded in 2004. I have an NIH postdoctoral fellowship that was from 2004 to 2008, and I have was a professor
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	INDEX Examination by: Page Mr. Zifchak 4	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Um-hum. Q. Are you taking any medication or anything that would impact your ability to testify today? A. No. Q. And again, these are preliminary questions. How did you prepare for today's deposition? A. I I guess I've met with counsel and looked over some previous correspondences. Q. In the last week or so have you seen any specific document requests that we provided to your counsel? A. I'm trying to recall. Yes. Q. Would you please recap your educational background? A. Sure. I have an undergraduate degree from the University of Virginia which was awarded in 1997. It's in biology. I have a Ph.D. in neurobiology and behavior from Georgia State University. It was awarded in 2004. I have an NIH postdoctoral fellowship that was from 2004 to 2008, and I have was a professor since that time in 2008, two different

(515) 288-4910

(515) 288-4910

9

12

1 2 appointed, it was my understanding that Doctor Rumbaugh wasn't at the lab. 3

Q. Meaning of her own volition she was not at the lab? She was not active at the lab? Is that what you mean?

A. She was not active at the lab, it was my understanding.

Q. Sitting here today --

A. Yeah.

11 Q. -- is it correct that Doctor Rumbaugh

12 is not permitted access to the lab?

13 A. Yes.

14 **Q.** And for how long has that, I'll call 15 it, embargo been in place?

I don't know, but let's say since 16

17 the --

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

18 Q. Since your appointment?

19 Α. Riaht.

20 Q. And you agree with or you condone that

21 ban?

1

2

3

4

5

6

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

25

22 A. At this point in time.

23 Q. And can you explain why that is?

Yes. 24 Α.

25 **Q.** All right. Please do.

> **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.** (515) 288-4910

A. I think Doctor Rumbaugh poses a risk, a health and safety risk to the bonobos and to the people that work around her.

Also, Doctor Rumbaugh told me in the fall of 2013, and I subsequently educated myself and found her remarks at that time to be

7 accurate, that her involvement with the

8 organization would be detrimental to our ability

9 to fundraise or rebuild a -- you know, a

10 reputation -- a credible reputation and that if

11 my -- I'm trying to do what's best for the

12 bonobos, so we would have her continue to not be

13 involved so as not to compromise those things.

MR. ZIFCHAK: Could you read back

15 the last answer, please?

(Requested portion of the record

was read.)

Q. What is the basis for your statement that Doctor Rumbaugh would pose a health and safety risk to the bonobos since she hasn't had access to the bonobos for over a year?

22 A. I'm basing that on historical things 23 that have occurred.

24 Q. Like what?

> How far do you want me to go back? **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.** (515) 288-4910

2 A. I'll just kind of cherry-pick a couple 3 things that come off the top of my head.

4 **Due to Doctor Rumbaugh's** 5 negligence, slash, breaking of protocol, Kanzi

escaped and maimed Bill Fields, landing him in 6 the hospital for an extended period of time.

8 And I think he had to endure multiple surgeries.

Q. When was that?

A. I don't remember the exact year. I 10 11 would say it's on or about 2001, maybe.

Q. Okay. Anything else?

13 A. I am aware that Doctor -- under Doctor 14 Rumbaugh's care Nyota, when he was young, was 15 left unattended with two pitbull dogs in

16 Atlanta. Those dogs and Nyota subsequently went

17 into a neighborhood, where a neighbor notified

us, I believe, and that was fortunate. And 18

19 Nyota had to be retrieved, as were the dogs.

20 **Doctor Rumbaugh then proceeded to**

21 bring the dogs in with the bonobos and 22 instructed Kanzi and Panbanisha to physically

23 punish them.

24 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry,

25 say it again.

> **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.** (515) 288-4910

1 A. Doctor Rumbaugh proceeded to bring those dogs in and place them inside the

enclosure with Kanzi and Panbanisha, adult apes, and it was -- and instructed Kanzi and

5 Panbanisha to physically punish them.

Q. When did that occur? 6

7 A. I don't remember exactly. On or around 8 that 2001 time period.

Q. All right. Anything else?

9 10 A. I'm aware Doctor Rumbaugh brought Teco, 11 who was a young baby at the time, to a public event, exposing him to a number of different, 12

13 you know, pathogens that potentially could be

14 involved in public -- and I'm not 100 percent

15 sure, but I actually think it violated USDA law

16 transporting him in that way. I'm aware of --

17 So that was a separate incident. Separate

18 incident.

19 **Doctor Rumbaugh exposed Teco to** 20 numerous visitors. This has been reported to me 21 over and over again, exposing -- that are

22 neither providing health documentation or

23 wearing appropriate protective equipment to make

24 sure that they are not transmitting diseases to

25 young Teco.

> **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.** (515) 288-4910

9

13

16

19

5

13

- **Q.** Anything else?
- 2 A. I'm aware of a number of incidences in
- 3 which Doctor Rumbaugh allowed baby Teco to get
- into various over-the-counter medications and --4
- 5 and was -- had to be treated a number of times.
- And I believe even one of them included a burn 6
- 7 from coffee.

1

8

15

18

23

1

2

- **Q.** Anything else?
- 9 A. I'm aware of an incident that occurred
- 10 with Nyota and Kanzi. There may have, in fact,
- 11 been multiple incidences, Doctor Rumbaugh has
- not been clear to me on that in e-mail, in which 12
- 13 it resulted in Nyota fracturing his maxilla,
- which is the upper part of the jaw. 14
 - **Q.** When did that occur? Do you know?
- I believe that occurred sometime in 16
- 17 2010.
 - **Q.** What about the coffee burning episode?
- 19 A. I'm not -- I'd have to check the
- 20 record. I don't recall. It's since Teco has
- 21 been alive.
- 22 **Q.** Anything else?
 - A. I'm aware of a -- I believe a fight
- 24 between Maisha and Nyota in which they sustained
- 25 an injury. And it's my understanding that for **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.**

(515) 288-4910

71

- whatever reason protocols dictated that they not be placed together at the time.
- 3 Q. When was that?
- 4 A. I think that was around the -- sometime
- 5 in -- I would -- I don't recall exactly. I'd
- 6 have to check. In Iowa.
- 7 Q. It was in Iowa?
- 8 A. Um-hum.
- 9 **Q.** Anything else?
- A. I'm aware of an incident in which 10
- 11 Doctor Rumbaugh placed a small dog with the
- 12 entire group of bonobos and that the bonobos
- 13 harmed the dog to the point where it had to
- 14 basically be given surgery -- I think it was
- 15 multiple surgeries. It was practically dead.
- 16 It was removed by staff with the help of one of
- 17 the bonobos.
 - Q. When was that?
- 19 A. I think -- I'm not sure. I can't say
- 20 for certain.

18

21

- Do you want to continue?
- 22 Q. Sure.
- 23 A. I'm aware of -- Well, never mind. I'm
- 24 not going to say that one. 25
 - Not to jump out of order, but **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.**

(515) 288-4910

- in -- sometime, I believe, in 1999 Doctor
- Rumbaugh placed a new graduate student in close
- proximity of the cage with -- with -- this
- person was basically brand new, and Doctor
- 5 Rumbaugh instructed her to sit with her back up
- 6 against the cage with the bonobos inside. It's
- extremely risky behavior that could have
- 8 resulted in an injury.
 - **Q.** Anything else?
- 10 A. Again in Atlanta Doctor Rumbaugh put a
- 11 research technician in the position where she
- 12 was bitten, I think, twice on the leg.
 - **Q.** What was the name of the technician?
- 14 A. Mary -- Mary Minahan at the time.
- 15 M-I-N-A-H-A-N.
 - **Q.** Anything else?
- 17 A. I'm thinking. I don't want to repeat 18
 - myself.
- At some point when Doctor
- 20 Rumbaugh was -- At some point since 2010 Nyota's
- 21 canines have been surgically removed as far as
- 22 we know or have been removed by some other
- 23 mechanism. I conclude that they've been
- 24 surgically removed because I've talked with a
- 25 number of primate and great ape veterinarians **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.**

(515) 288-4910

- 1 who have never heard of an instance where both
- canines would be gone. We will verify that with
- radiographs. Okay? Removal of canines of a
- 4 great ape is cruel and inhumane.
 - **Q.** Anything else?
- A. I'm just -- I'm just thinking at this 6
 - point. There were a number of times when I was
- 8 in graduate school that I came into the lab to
- work and found locks off the cages, which would 9
- 10 be locks that -- that means the primary
- 11 mechanism by which to keep the apes inside the
- enclosure and me on the outside. 12
 - **Q.** Anything else?
- 14 A. I think at this point I probably have
- 15 exhausted my, you know, short-term memory for
- 16 doing things like this. I'd have to check my
- 17 notes. I believe there are additional
- 18 incidences.
- 19 Q. Do you have notes that you've collected 20 on all of these incidents?
- 21 A. Not in a systematic way, no.
- 22 Q. But you do have notes?
 - A. I think I have e-mail correspondences
- 24 that may jog my memory.
- 25 **Q.** How many of the incidents that you've **HUNEY-VAUGHN COURT REPORTERS, LTD.**

(515) 288-4910

23